# **Appendix 7 - Business Case Assessment Summary Table**

| Scheme Details     |   | Appraisal Summary |   | Recommendation/<br>Conditions |  |
|--------------------|---|-------------------|---|-------------------------------|--|
| Project<br>Name    | Cribbs<br>Patchway<br>MetroBus<br>Extension<br>(CPME) | Strategic<br>Case | CPME will be improve access to a number of existing and future employment sites including Rolls Royce, Horizon 38, Filton Enterprise Area and Cribbs Causeway.  The project will also improve access for existing and planned residential developments in Stoke Gifford, Little Stoke and the Cribbs Patchway New Neighbourhood (CPNN).  The project aligns with West of England Strategic Economic Plan, emerging Joint Local Transport Plan, South Gloucestershire Core Strategy and the objectives of the Economic Development to enable growth in the Enterprise Area.  South Gloucestershire Core Strategy, Policy CS26 (CPNN development) requires the implementation of Policy CS7 which includes the CPME scheme.  The scheme presents a strong strategic case. | Funding Source(s)             | Economic<br>Development Fund<br>and Investment<br>Fund |
| Scheme<br>Promoter | South<br>Gloucestershire<br>Council                   | State Aid         | The project will provide open access public infrastructure and will not favour a particular economic undertaking.   | Approval<br>Requested         | Final Approval<br>Business Case                        |

### ITEM 13

| Date of<br>Submission   | 12/3/19 Economic<br>Case and<br>Value for<br>Money   |  | A letter has been provided by the SGC s151 officer which approval of the business case and that the project represents good value for money in the use of public resources.  The scheme presents a core Benefit to Cost Ratio of 2.53 which represents 'high' value for money. | Grant Award     | £35m EDF and<br>£21.9m Investment<br>Fund   |
|-------------------------|--|--|--|-----------------|---|
| Funding<br>Requested    | £56.851m   |  | The Value for Money Statement is shown below.  |                 |   |
| Total<br>Scheme<br>Cost | £56.9m (Project Management £3.82m; Land £2.91m; Gipsy Patch Lane Bridge £26.73m; Design and Construction £11.84m; Risk £6.88m; Other £4.67m) | Risk   | A detailed risk register has been provided.  A Quantified Risk Assessment has been undertaken which yields a risk allowance of £6.878m at a P(80) level excluding Network Rail risk allowance. This represent 12% of scheme cost.  | Grant Recipient | South<br>Gloucestershire<br>Council   |
| Match<br>Funding %      | 0%   | The scheme has secured land needed for a bus stop on Gipsy Patch Lane and a site for a construction compound. Negotiations to secure the other third party land required for the scheme are reported as progressing well and are at an advanced stage.  The Compulsory Purchase Order and Side Road Order to support the negotiation process for the land required for the railway bridge replacement was advertised in March 2019.  The procurement process is well progressed with Network Rail delivering the Gipsy Patch Lane Railway Bridge and SGC Streetcare the other highway works along the route. The infrastructure within |  | Payment Basis   | EDF – capital and interest every 6 months based upon staged payments.  Investment Fund - quarterly in arrears on defrayed expenditure |

ITEM 13

|  |  |  | the CPNN and Horizon 38 developments is being provided by the developer under their planning agreement  |   |  |
|--|--|--|---|---|--|
|  |  |  | The proposed drawdown of EDF funding is over the period 19/20-20/21 in annual payments which fits within the EDF allocations for this scheme and agreed approach to dealing with staged payments. The drawdown of the Investment Find is over the period 19/20-22/23. |   |  |
|  |  |  | Construction start is planned in July 2019 with completion expected in April 2022.  |   |  |
| Scheme Description   |  |  | Recommendation<br>to Joint<br>Committee   | Approval subject to conditions                                |  |
| CPME is an extension to the West of England's metrobus network. It will link Bristol Parkway Station and The Mall Bus Station via the Cribbs Patchway New Neighbourhood (CPNN) re-development site at the former Filton Airfield, the Horizon 38 development site, Gipsy Patch Lane and Hatchet Road.  |  |  | Conditions of   | a) Supply of a<br>detailed<br>elemental cost<br>breakdown for |  |
| The scheme includes the replacement of the existing railway bridge on Gipsy Patch Lane with a new wider bridge to relieve the existing pinch point, the extension and signalisation of the San Andreas roundabout to allow the construction of a new bus only arm to link to the CPNN, and bus lanes on Gipsy Patch Lane. Metrobus stops and walking/cycling infrastructure are also included. |  |  | Approval  | the highway<br>works<br>b) Securing all<br>necessary land     |  |

#### **Record of Approval**

| WECA S151 Officer |             | Joint Committee    |              |  |
|-------------------|-------------|--------------------|--------------|--|
| Name              | Malcom Coe  | Date of<br>Meeting | 14 June 2019 |  |
| Date              | 4 June 2019 | Decision           |              |  |
| Signature         | M           |                    |              |  |

## **Cribbs Patchway MetroBus Extension - Value for Money Statement**

#### Summary of Scheme Impacts (2010 prices, discounted for 60 years)

| Criteria  | Commentary   |  |  |  |
|---|--|--|--|--|
| Value for Money   | The scheme offers high value for money   |  |  |  |
| NPV   | £64.5m   |  |  |  |
| Core BCR  | 2.5 (high)   |  |  |  |
| Summary of the benefits and                               |  |  |  |  |
| costs   | • £26.4m benefits to bus users;  |  |  |  |
| Scheme Benefits & Disbenefits                             | • £16.8m benefits to rail & bus/rail users;  |  |  |  |
|   | • £10.4m benefits to highway users;  |  |  |  |
|   | • £25.5m benefits for improved journey quality/facilities;   |  |  |  |
|   | • £13.3m benefits for improved health/reduced absenteeism;   |  |  |  |
| Scheme Costs  | • £0.8m benefits for improved greenhouse gas emissions;  |  |  |  |
|   | • £2.3m of disbenefits from 9 month closure of Gipsy Patch Lane;   |  |  |  |
|   | • £23.4m of benefits from "permanent" alteration to Filton Avenue North  |  |  |  |
|   | • £40.8m of scheme build costs   |  |  |  |
|   | • £1.5m of scheme renewal costs (I-points and Shelters every 10 years)   |  |  |  |
| Significant non-monetised impacts                         | Noise – but was considered during the scheme transport appraisal;<br>Farebox revenue and service operating cost: The report indicates that that farebox revenue could exceed service operating cost. As detailed discussions with potential operators has not been completed yet, and to adopt a conservative approach these potential scheme benefits have not been included in the analysis. |  |  |  |
| Key risks, sensitivities and uncertainties underlying the | Delivery profile of the CPNN development   |  |  |  |
| appraisal   | Provision of CPME service by public transport operator, response of competing services to the new service  |  |  |  |
| Significant social or distributional impacts              | Physical activity benefits due to increased walking and cycling.  Security and journey quality benefits due to measures including improved stops, CCTV, passenger information and crossing facilities.  Accessibility net benefits due to improved bus services.  Based on a high level assessment of distributional impacts, a range of income groups   |  |  |  |
|   | benefit from the scheme. The scheme benefits areas with a high concentration of children, and low concentrations of elderly residents and residents with a disability.   |  |  |  |